SHRI CHINTA MOHAN: It is a suggestion given by the Madam and we will study it. This is a problem going on for eleven years, not arising today.

SHRIMATI BIJOYA CHAKRAVARTY: Not only myself, the whole House is very much disturbed by the passive answers of the honourable Minister not only on this question but on all questions. The point is this. The Minister in his statement has said, "In a number of cases progress has been hampered on account of the non-receipt of the complete data for the entire relevant period." Now, who is responsible for it? Has the Minister identified the concerned officers who are responsible for not getting the data so that he can resort to some criminal procedure action against those companies? And what is the time-frame?

SHRI CHINTA MOHAN: Very soon we will try to take strong action.

SHRIMATI BIJOYA CHAKRAVARTY: What is this? This is a very bad performance. We are very sorry. I want to put another question: Is the Minister joining hands with the bureaucrats?

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : सभापति जी श्री चिंतामोहन सबसे निश्चिंत मंत्री बन कर आते हैं यहां पर । कोई तैयारी नहीं होती । इतना निश्चिंत मंत्री हमने नहीं देखा । कोई चिंता नहीं, निश्चिन्त होकर दोनों हाथ ऐसे । . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . . कोई कागज नहीं, कोई कुछ नहीं । . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . . सभापति जी, कम से कम आप नोटिस लीजिए इस चीज का, इतना महत्वपूर्ण प्रश्नकाल हो रहा है, दोनों हाथ ऐसे करके जवाब देते चले जाते हैं । . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . . दोनों हाथ आगे कर देते हैं। . . . . **(व्यवधान)**

श्री सभापति : यह स्थितप्रज्ञ है । . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . .

एक माननीय सदस्य : सर, परिस्थिति नरपेक्ष भी लग रहे हैं वह । . . . .

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : हां, वह परिस्थिति निरपेक्ष हैं । उन पर किसी परिस्थिति का कोई असर नहीं है । . . . **(व्यवधान)** We don't want *sthithirapragyas.*

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Sir, the whole House appreciates the positive tribute of the Chair to the Minister.

Production of patented drugs in India

*235. SHRIMATI MIRA DAS
SHRI SARADA MOHANTY:†

Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that patented drugs like anti-biotics are produced upto 42 per cent cardio vascular drugs, 51 per cent anti-inflamatory drugs, 21 per cent tranquillisers, 60 per cent, anti asthmatics, 42 per cent anti-bacterial, 98 per cent of the total production of each category in India while U.S. is alleging that only 5 per cent of such drugs are sold in India;

(b) whether it is also a fact consent to Dunkel proposals would lead to acceptance of the Paris Convention whereby detachment from the Dunkel agreement would take a five year period; and

(c) wheher it is a fact that Government have decided to accept Dunkel proposals on Patent of drugs and chemicals; if so, what are their implications?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF CHEMICALS AND FERTILIZERS (SHRI CHINTA MOHAN): (a) to (c) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

---

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Sarada Mahanty.

Statement

(a) As per available information indigenous production of drugs covered by product patents abroad is as given below:—

Anti infectives	16%
Cardiovascular drugs	51%
Non-Steroidal anti-inflammatory drugs (NSAIDS)	20%
Tranquillisers	17%
Anti Asthamatics	11%

It is estimated that about 10-15 percent of total production in the country is covered by product patents abroad.

(b) and (c) No, Sir. The Dunkel proposals are still in the process of being examined by the Govt. and Govt.'s stand in respect of these proposal has not yet been finalised.

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH: Sir, what happened to the question?... (*Interruptions*)...

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF INDUSTRY (SHRI P. K. THUNGON): He has said that a statement is laid on the Table of the House... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI AJIT P. K. JOGI: "Brevity is the coul of wit."... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SARADA MOHANTY: Sir, I want to know whether the Government would consult the Opposition parties before finalising their views on the Dunkel proposals and what steps have been taken so far in this direction.

SHRI CHINTA MOHAN: Sir, the Government has already constituted a Sub-Committee of the Cabinet and they have already invited all the experts and the Opposition leaders and they are taking their views. Once the Government comes out with its proposal, we will inform the House.

SHRI SARADA MOHANTY: Sir, I have no second supplementary.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Chimanbhai Mehta.

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA: Sir, I would like to draw the attention of the House to part (b) of the question. The question is whether it is also a fact that consent to the Dunkel proposals would lead to acceptance of the Paris Convention whereby detachment from the Dunkel agreement would take a five-year period.

Now, the position is that once you accept the Dunkel proposal, you cannot go back immediately saying that you would terminate something within a week because, once you accept the Dunkel proposal, *ipso facto* it means that you are accepting the Paris Convention and the Paris Convention does not allow you to get out of it for five years. Therefore, my point is that acceptance of the Dunkel proposal would lead to acceptance of the Paris Convention also. To this particular point, Sir, the Minister has not replied at all. Therefore, I would like to know whether my information or my interpretation is correct or incorrect and also how you are going to protect the interests of the product patents.

SHRI CHINTA MOHAN: Sir, the Dunkel proposals are still under the examination of the Cabinet Sub-Committee. Once we come out with our views on these proposals, we will inform yoyu. I cannot say anything at this stage... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA: Sir, my question relates to part (b) of the main question. I am not asking about the Cabinet Sub-Committee. You have not answered my question at all.

(*Interruptions*)...What is the linkage of the Paris Convention with the Dunkel proposals? You are not explaning it at all ...(*Interruptions*).. Sir, this is not a hypothetical question ...(*Interruptions*)...I am putting a straight question and he has to make it absolutely clear...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH: Sir, Mr. Sharad Power should come to his help...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA: Sir, he may defer the question; I don't mind...(*Interruptions*)...He may defer the question if he is not prepared. But this is a clear question and it is a part of the main question. I am not asking this question just now on the floor of the House...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH: Sir, some Cabinet Minister should come to his help...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDY: Sir, you may kindly read part (b) of the question. A specific question has been asked as to whether there is any nexus between the Paris Convention and the Dunkel proposals. It is a part of the substantive question. So, how can the Minister be silent on this? His silence is eloquent.

SHRI CHINTA MOHAN: Sir, we are examining it and there is no nexus, as the honourable Member has said...(*Interruptions*)...At the appropriate time, when once we prepare our draft on the Dunkel proposals, we will inform...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: He has asked whether there is any connection between the Dunkel proposal and the Paris Convention...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA: Sir, he has said that there is no nexus...(*Interruptions*)...Mr. Minister, are you sure about it?...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. BAPU KALDATE: Sir, is he examining it?...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA: Sir, let him say that he is not ready and he is deferring the question; I do not mind...(*Interruptions*)...I do not mind it, because there is a nexus and he does not know. That is the trouble ...(*Interruptions*)...Let him not say that there is no nexus.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Once it is accepted that it will go to Paris, but it is still not accepted, how can it go to Paris? (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let it stay in Delhi. Shri Swell.

SHRI G. G. SWELL: Sir, I don't understand this talk of nexus. The fact is that the Dunkel proposals are going to be discussed in the next round of negotiations in Paris. Now, Sir, I would like the Minister to listen to me carefully (*Interruptions*). It is a fact that the Dunkel proposals are not yesteray's proposals. They are with us now for almost a year, and successive Governments have considered these.

AN HON. MEMBER: No. It is wrong.

SHRI G. G. SWELL: It had to come to you. You have been talking about it, discussing about it. I am subject to correction if you have not. Now, under Dunkel there is such a thing the trade related intellectual property rights.

The Minister has said that it is before the Cabinet Committee. And when you go to the Committee you have made some kind of groundwork preparatory work. Now, is it a fact under the Dunkel proposals before us, which are on a take it or leave it" basis, if you do not take the Dunkel proposals you are out of the global marketing system, and if you take the Dunkel proposals you have to come under its effect. I would like to know whether the Government has made a study of the drugs that are produced in India that come under the American patent. And if that happens how

much will it affect our drug industry, how many of our present pharmaceutical firms would be able to produce those drugs? (*Interruptions*) Please don't disturb me. Will you be able to produce those drugs which come under the American patents and by how much the prices of drugs and pharmaceuticals will go up as a result of Dunkel? Your preparatory work does not say that. You sent it to the Cabinet Sub-Committee. You must have done some preparatory work.

SHRI CHINTA MOHAN: The whole question of Dunkel proposals, as I already said, is under examination by the Cabinet Sub-Committee, and my Department will also be reviewing it. If the hon. Member wants it, we will write to him. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Sir, I want to know from the hon. Minister this. The Dunkel proposals may be under the examination of a Cabinet Sub-Committee. You are not competent to answer; it is fine. You are well aware that the drug industry is a major industry that would be affected by these proposals. Your Ministry is the administrative Ministry for the drug industry. What is the view of your Ministry as conveyed to the Prime Minister or to the Cabinet with respect to the Dunkel proposals? Has your Ministry crystalised its views and if so, what are these?

SHRI CHINTA MOHAN: At present I cannot say anything. We are studying the entire gamut of proposals.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Next question.

*236. [*Transferred to the 16th March, 1992*]

Disinvestment of Defence Land Holdings

*237. SHRI HIPHEI: Will the Minister of DEFENCE be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government plan to disinvest ten per cent of defence land holdings with a view to generate additional financial resources; and

(b) if so, the details thereof?

THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI SHARAD PAWAR): (a) and (b) There is no plan to disinvest 10 per cent of the Defence land holdings. However, Goverment are examining the possibility of generating additional resources by disposing of lands which may be surplus to Defence requirements.

SHRI HIPHEI: Sir, what is the exact area of the surplus land after Defence requirements?

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, the Defence Ministry has got more than 22,16,000 acres of land, and out of that about 30 per cent land is under use. The rest land is vacant. We are trying to get information from the respective Wings as to which land we will be able to dispose of. That information has not yet been received.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question Hour is over. Now, Papers to be laid on the Table.

Written Answers to Questions

ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों के युवकों को प्रशिक्षण दिये जाने संबंधी योजना

*221. श्री राम जेटमलानी :
श्री रणजीत सिंह :

क्या प्रधान मंत्री यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि :

(क) क्या सरकार का ध्यान 10 फरवरी, 1992 के दैनिक ट्रिब्यून में "ट्रेनिंग स्कीम फार रूरल यूथ" शीर्षक के अंतर्गत प्रकाशित समाचार की ओर दिलाया गया है ;

(ख) क्या सरकार ने ग्रामीण क्षेत्र के युवकों को स्वरोजगार के अवसर प्रदान किये जाने हेतु उन्हें औद्योगिक प्रशिक्षण दिये जाने के संबंध में कोई योजना लागू करनेका निश्चय किया है ;